

Assessment form: Comparative Study

Student: ...
 Title thesis: ...
 Data Defence: ...
 Promotor: ...
 Jurymembers: ...
 Supervising Assistant: ...

END RESULT:	... / 20
-------------	----------

Pass [10 .. 13[

Is the problem described precisely?	Yes / No / No reply
Are the techniques (their similarities and differences) clearly described?	Yes / No / No reply.
Are the criteria for comparison clearly described?	Yes / No / No reply
Are conclusions drawn? (when should one use which technique?)	Yes / No / No reply

If the thesis committee answers “no” on two or more criteria, the thesis will be given a FAIL grade. The fine-grained criteria will then determine the exact grade.

Distinction [13 .. 15[

Is the question "why a comparative study answered convincingly? Is it clear that the problem is relevant, different usable techniques exist and the results seem uncertain?)	Yes / No / No reply
Is an overview of the applicable techniques presented? (Are the differences and similarities between the different techniques framed in a broader context?)	Yes / No / No reply
Are the chosen criteria well motivated? (Are the different criteria explained? Is the choice for the given criteria explained with respect to the problem?)	Yes / No / No reply
Are the criteria and their application reproducible? (Is sufficient detail given, its application by a third--party would lead to the same results?)	Yes / No / No reply
Are the conclusions convincing? (Is the problem presented in a sufficiently abstract way so that the conclusions are also relevant for similar problems?)	Yes / No / No reply

If the thesis committee answers “no” on two or more criteria, the thesis will be given a SATISFACTORY grade. The fine-grained criteria will then determine the exact grade.

Great distinction [15 .. 17[

Is the problem well situated within its context? (Is there a precise explanation of the greater problem the thesis needs to be situated in? Is there a convincing motivation for the choice of the smaller problem that the thesis intends to solve?)	Yes / No / No reply
Is a broad overview of the popular solution techniques given? (Is the overview of the different solution techniques almost complete?)	Yes / No / No reply
Is there a repeatable weighting of the pros and cons of the popular techniques? (Can the same kind of weighting of the pros and cons be used for a similar problem, without the solution having to be the same?)	Yes / No / No reply
Is the experiment representative? (Is it clear to which degree the experiment's results are applicable for similar problems?)	Yes / No / No reply

Do the conclusions show a deep insight into the greater problem? (Are the conclusions drawn about the smaller problem that the thesis has solved linked back to the greater problem? Is there a realistic prognosis toward the future?)	Yes / No / No reply
---	---------------------

If the reading committee answers “no” on two or more criteria, the thesis will be awarded with DISTINCTION. The fine-grained criteria will then determine the exact grade.

Greatest distinction [17 .. 20]

Does the thesis introduce a novel way of looking at the problem? (Are there elements in the text that shed inspiring new light on the problem?)	Yes / No / No reply
Do the conclusions provide a significant contribution to the problem domain? (Will the thesis be cited within the problem domain?)	Yes / No / No reply

If the reading committee answers “no” to at least one criterion, the thesis will be awarded with GREAT DISTINCTION. If not, it will be awarded with GREATEST DISTINCTION. In both cases the fine---grained criteria will determine the exact grade.

Fine-grained Criteria

Relationship with “Research Project 1” and “Research Project 2”:

Not applicable

Sections were not considered in the evaluation of the master’s thesis

Sections have been assessed more thoroughly.

The “Related work” section was assessed as being complete and systematic

Other:

Clarity (text):	Insufficient / Unclear / Average / Good / Excellent / No reply
Presentation (defense):	Insufficient / Unclear / Average / Good / Excellent / No reply
Independence:	Insufficient / Unclear / Average / Good / Excellent / No reply
Workload:	Insufficient / Unclear / Average / Good / Excellent / No reply